

# Concise Minutes – Health and Social Care Committee

---

Meeting Venue:

Committee Room 3 – Senedd

Meeting date: Wednesday,

25 November 2015

Meeting time: 09.00 – 12.12

This meeting can be viewed

on [Senedd TV](#) at:

<http://senedd.tv/en/3321>

---

## Attendance

Category	Names
Assembly Members:	David Rees AM (Chair) Peter Black AM (In place of Kirsty Williams AM) Alun Davies AM John Griffiths AM Altaf Hussain AM Elin Jones AM Darren Millar AM Lynne Neagle AM Gwyn R Price AM Lindsay Whittle AM
Witnesses:	Kirsty Williams AM, Member in charge of the Safe Nurse Staffing Levels (Wales) Bill Philippa Watkins, National Assembly for Wales Commission Lisa Salkeld, National Assembly for Wales Commission Mark Drakeford AM, The Minister for Health and Social



Cynulliad  
Cenedlaethol  
Cymru

National  
Assembly for  
Wales

	<p>Services</p> <p>Helen Whyley, Welsh Government</p> <p>Rhian Williams, Welsh Government</p>
Committee Staff:	<p>Llinos Madeley (Clerk)</p> <p>Gareth Howells (Legal Adviser)</p> <p>Catherine Hunt (Second Clerk)</p> <p>Sian Giddins (Deputy Clerk)</p> <p>Gwyn Griffiths (Legal Adviser)</p> <p>Amy Clifton (Researcher)</p> <p>Philippa Watkins (Researcher)</p>

## Transcript

View the [meeting transcript](#).

### 1 Introductions, apologies and substitutions

1.1 There were no apologies.

1.2 For items relating to the Safe Nurse Staffing Levels (Wales) Bill, Peter Black substituted for Kirsty Williams.

### 2 Safe Nurse Staffing Levels (Wales) Bill: Stage 2 – consideration of amendments

2.1 Lynne Neagle declared the following relevant interest under Standing Order 17.24A:

- She has a close family member currently living on a mental health inpatient ward

2.2 In accordance with Standing Order 26.21, the Committee disposed of the following amendments to the Bill:

### Amendment 28 (Mark Drakeford)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Davies	Altaf Hussain	Peter Black
John Griffiths	Darren Millar	
Elin Jones		
Lynne Neagle		
Gwyn R Price		
David Rees		
Lindsay Whittle		
<b>Amendment 28 was agreed.</b>		

### Amendment 29A (Darren Millar)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Peter Black	Alun Davies	
Altaf Hussain	John Griffiths	
Elin Jones	Lynne Neagle	
Darren Millar	Gwyn R Price	
Lindsay Whittle	David Rees	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 29A was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 29B (Darren Millar)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Peter Black	Alun Davies	
Altaf Hussain	John Griffiths	
Elin Jones	Lynne Neagle	
Darren Millar	Gwyn R Price	
Lindsay Whittle	David Rees	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 29B was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 29C (Darren Millar)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Altaf Hussain	Peter Black	
Darren Millar	Alun Davies	
	John Griffiths	
	Elin Jones	
	Lynne Neagle	
	Gwyn R Price	
	David Rees	
	Lindsay Whittle	
<b>Amendment 29C was not agreed</b>		

## Amendment 29D (Darren Millar)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Peter Black	Alun Davies	
Altaf Hussain	John Griffiths	
Elin Jones	Lynne Neagle	
Darren Millar	Gwyn R Price	
Lindsay Whittle	David Rees	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 29D was not agreed.</b>		

Amendments 29E, 29F, 29G, 29H and 29I (Darren Millar) were disposed of en bloc.

In favour	Against	Abstain
Peter Black	Alun Davies	
Altaf Hussain	John Griffiths	
Elin Jones	Lynne Neagle	
Darren Millar	Gwyn R Price	
Lindsay Whittle	David Rees	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendments 29E, 29F, 29G, 29H and 29I were not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 29J (Darren Millar)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Altaf Hussain	Peter Black	
Elin Jones	Alun Davies	
Darren Millar	John Griffiths	
Lindsay Whittle	Lynne Neagle	
	Gwyn R Price	
	David Rees	
<b>Amendment 29J was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 29Z (Elin Jones)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Altaf Hussain	Peter Black	
Elin Jones	Alun Davies	
Darren Millar	John Griffiths	
Lindsay Whittle	Lynne Neagle	
	Gwyn R Price	
	David Rees	
<b>Amendment 29Z was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 29AA (Elin Jones)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Altaf Hussain	Peter Black	
Elin Jones	Alun Davies	
Darren Millar	John Griffiths	
Lindsay Whittle	Lynne Neagle	
	Gwyn R Price	
	David Rees	
<b>Amendment 29AA was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 29AB (Elin Jones)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Altaf Hussain	Peter Black	
Elin Jones	Alun Davies	
Darren Millar	John Griffiths	
Lindsay Whittle	Lynne Neagle	
	Gwyn R Price	
	David Rees	
<b>Amendment 29AB was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 29AC (Elin Jones)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Altaf Hussain	Peter Black	
Elin Jones	Alun Davies	
Darren Millar	John Griffiths	
Lindsay Whittle	Lynne Neagle	
	Gwyn R Price	
	David Rees	
<b>Amendment 29AC was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 29AD (Elin Jones)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Altaf Hussain	Peter Black	
Elin Jones	Alun Davies	
Darren Millar	John Griffiths	
Lindsay Whittle	Lynne Neagle	
	Gwyn R Price	
	David Rees	
<b>Amendment 29AD was not agreed.</b>		

Amendments 29K, 29L, 29M, 29N and 29O (Darren Millar) were disposed of en bloc.

In favour	Against	Abstain
Peter Black	Alun Davies	
Altaf Hussain	John Griffiths	
Elin Jones	Lynne Neagle	
Darren Millar	Gwyn R Price	
Lindsay Whittle	David Rees	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendments 29K, 29L, 29M, 29N and 29O were not agreed.</b>		

Amendment 29P (Darren Millar)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Peter Black	Alun Davies	
Altaf Hussain	John Griffiths	
Elin Jones	Lynne Neagle	
Darren Millar	Gwyn R Price	
Lindsay Whittle	David Rees	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 29P was not agreed.</b>		

Amendment 29Q (Darren Millar) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

**Amendment 29R (Darren Millar)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Peter Black	Alun Davies	
Altaf Hussain	John Griffiths	
Elin Jones	Lynne Neagle	
Darren Millar	Gwyn R Price	
Lindsay Whittle	David Rees	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 29R was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 29S (Darren Millar)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Peter Black	Alun Davies	
Altaf Hussain	John Griffiths	
Elin Jones	Lynne Neagle	
Darren Millar	Gwyn R Price	
Lindsay Whittle	David Rees	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 29S was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 29T (Darren Millar)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Altaf Hussain	Peter Black	
Elin Jones	Alun Davies	
Darren Millar	John Griffiths	
Lindsay Whittle	Lynne Neagle	
	Gwyn R Price	
	David Rees	
<b>Amendment 29T was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 29U (Darren Millar)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Altaf Hussain	Peter Black	
Elin Jones	Alun Davies	
Darren Millar	John Griffiths	
Lindsay Whittle	Lynne Neagle	
	Gwyn R Price	
	David Rees	
<b>Amendment 29U was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 29V (Darren Millar)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Peter Black	Alun Davies	
Altaf Hussain	John Griffiths	
Elin Jones	Lynne Neagle	
Darren Millar	Gwyn R Price	
Lindsay Whittle	David Rees	
<b>As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 29V was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 29W (Darren Millar)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Altaf Hussain	Peter Black	
Darren Millar	Alun Davies	
	John Griffiths	
	Elin Jones	
	Lynne Neagle	
	Gwyn R Price	
	David Rees	
	Lindsay Whittle	
<b>Amendment 29W was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 29X (Darren Millar)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Altaf Hussain	Peter Black	
Elin Jones	Alun Davies	
Darren Millar	John Griffiths	
Lindsay Whittle	Lynne Neagle	
	Gwyn R Price	
	David Rees	
<b>Amendment 29X was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 29Y (Darren Millar)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Altaf Hussain	Peter Black	
Elin Jones	Alun Davies	
Darren Millar	John Griffiths	
Lindsay Whittle	Lynne Neagle	
	Gwyn R Price	
	David Rees	
<b>Amendment 29Y was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 29AE (Elin Jones) was not moved.**

## Amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Davies	Altaf Hussain	Peter Black
John Griffiths	Elin Jones	
Lynne Neagle	Darren Millar	
Gwyn R Price	Lindsay Whittle	
David Rees		
<b>Amendment 29 was agreed.</b>		

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 1 (Darren Millar) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 20 (Elin Jones) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 2 (Darren Millar) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 21 (Elin Jones) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 3 (Darren Millar) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 4 (Darren Millar) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 22 (Elin Jones) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 23 (Elin Jones) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 24 (Elin Jones) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 5 (Darren Millar) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 6 (Darren Millar) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 7 (Darren Millar) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 8 (Darren Millar) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 9 (Darren Millar) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 10 (Darren Millar) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 11 (Darren Millar) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 12 (Darren Millar) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 25 (Elin Jones) fell.

As amendment 29W (Darren Millar) was not agreed, amendment 30A (Darren Millar) fell.

As amendment 29X (Darren Millar) was not agreed, amendment 30B (Darren Millar) fell.

Amendment 30 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 13 (Darren Millar) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 14 (Darren Millar) fell.

**Amendment 31A (Darren Millar)**

In favour	Against	Abstain
Peter Black	Alun Davies	
Altaf Hussain	John Griffiths	
Elin Jones	Lynne Neagle	
Darren Millar	Gwyn R Price	
Lindsay Whittle	David Rees	
As the vote was tied, the Chair used his casting vote in the negative (in accordance with SO 6.20(ii)). Therefore amendment 31A was not agreed.		

**Amendment 31 (Mark Drakeford)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 15 (Darren Millar) fell.

As amendment 29 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendment 16 (Darren Millar) fell.

**Amendment 36 (Darren Millar)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Altaf Hussain	Peter Black	
Darren Millar	Alun Davies	
	John Griffiths	
	Elin Jones	
	Lynne Neagle	
	Gwyn R Price	
	David Rees	
	Lindsay Whittle	
<b>Amendment 36 was not agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 37 (Darren Millar)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Altaf Hussain	Peter Black	
Darren Millar	Alun Davies	
	John Griffiths	
	Elin Jones	
	Lynne Neagle	
	Gwyn R Price	
	David Rees	
	Lindsay Whittle	
<b>Amendment 37 was not agreed.</b>		

## Amendment 32 (Mark Drakeford)

In favour	Against	Abstain
Alun Davies	Altaf Hussain	Peter Black
John Griffiths	Elin Jones	
Lynne Neagle	Darren Millar	
Gwyn R Price	Lindsay Whittle	
David Rees		
<b>Amendment 32 was agreed.</b>		

As amendment 32 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed, amendments 17 and 18 (Darren Millar) fell.

Amendment 19 (Darren Millar) was not moved.

Amendment 33 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

Amendment 34 (Mark Drakeford) was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

### **Amendment 35 (Mark Drakeford)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Alun Davies	Altaf Hussain	Peter Black
John Griffiths	Elin Jones	
Lynne Neagle	Darren Millar	
Gwyn R Price	Lindsay Whittle	
David Rees		
<b>Amendment 35 was agreed.</b>		

### **Amendment 27 (Mark Drakeford)**

<b>In favour</b>	<b>Against</b>	<b>Abstain</b>
Alun Davies	Altaf Hussain	Peter Black
John Griffiths	Elin Jones	
Lynne Neagle	Darren Millar	
Gwyn R Price	Lindsay Whittle	
David Rees		
<b>Amendment 27 was agreed.</b>		

**Amendment 38 (Mark Drakeford)** was agreed in accordance with Standing Order 17.34(i).

As **amendment 38 (Mark Drakeford)** was agreed, **amendment 39 (Elin Jones)** fell.

2.3 All sections of the Bill were deemed agreed by the Committee.

### **3 Motion under Standing Order 17.42(vi) to resolve to exclude the public from the remainder of this meeting**

3.1 The motion was agreed.

## **4 Public Health (Wales) Bill: consideration of the draft report**

4.1 The Committee considered and agreed, subject to minor changes, the Stage 1 draft report on the Public Health (Wales) Bill.

4.2 The Committee agreed to publish its Stage 1 report on the general principles of the Public Health (Wales) Bill on Monday 30 November. Although this is later than the deadline of 27 November agreed by the Business Committee, the Health and Social Care Committee noted that this decision will not have an impact on:

- the timing of the Stage 1 Plenary debate, currently scheduled for 8 December;
- the deadlines for subsequent amending stages, should the general principles of the Bill be agreed by the Assembly.